

ETAAC errata sheet for Draft Final Report – Chapter 1

For discussion at Feb. 11, 2008 meeting

ETAAC members: Please use this chart to specify any errors, typos or points for discussion you may see in the draft final report. Please include chapter #, page #, the text as it currently exists (enough words to uniquely identify the text or concept on the page), and either your preferred modified text or comment for discussion. (Table cells should expand to accommodate the length of your entry). Under significance, please indicate major if you believe the suggested change warrants group discussion, or minor for simple typographical errors that don't significantly change the meaning and thus are not worthy of discussion. Extend the table (add rows) as necessary. See examples below. Please coordinate through your sector lead so they can transmit to me (schurch@arb.ca.gov) by 4pm on Sunday, Feb. 10 (so I have time to process before the Monday morning meeting).

Submitter's Name: __combined comments of Fong Wan, Ed Pike, and Jamie Hall

| <u>Chapter #</u> | <u>Page #</u> | <u>Existing text</u> | <u>Desired text or comment</u> | <u>Significance?</u> |
|------------------|---------------|---|---|--------------------------|
| 1 | 1 | First sentence paragraph 4 | "... (CARB) a leadership role in forging new approaches to diminishing the state's carbon footprint (<u>working with other state agencies</u>). | Important - tone |
| 1 | 2 | Paragraph 2 line 6 | "address new alternative energy sources <u>and fuels</u> " | Clarification |
| 1 | 3 | Line 4 of paragraph following AB32 quote | "the state must focus its attention <u>and resources</u> ..." | clarification |
| 1 | 3 | Strategy #1 paragraph 1 line | "To competently <u>successfully</u> ..." | Correct awkward phrasing |
| 1 | 3 | Strategy #1, paragraph 1 currently says "section 5.III.B" | "Chapter 5.III.D" | Reference was renumbered |
| 1 | 4 | Strategy #2 paragraph 2 Row 11 | "Investing revenues in low <u>and zero</u> carbon technology ..." | clarification |
| 1 | 5 | Paragraph 2, 3 rd sentence "...achieve full commercial viability." | "(see Chapters 2.II.B and 4.III.I)" | clarification |
| 1 | 5 | Strategy #3 | "they expect a high return on their investment, <u>they</u> may not capture all the benefits of RD&D | Minor grammatical |

| | | | | |
|----------------------|-----|---|---|--|
| | | | investments, and <u>because</u> RD&D ...” | correction |
| 1 | 6 | 2 nd paragraph line 9 | <p>“a more competitive, low <u>and zero</u> carbon economy.”</p> <p><i>Also, add value (at least ballpark – “several hundred million dollars”) for California total RD&D spending in this paragraph – the legislature is interested in this</i></p> | 1) clarification; and 2) addition of important statistic |
| 1 | 7 | The references following the 1 st paragraph of strategy #5 (see Chapters 3.IV.H and 5.V.H) are incorrect | Delete incorrect references, and instead insert after 2 nd sentence of paragraph one: “See the Index at the end of this Chapter for many example. OR change references to match recommendations that call for coordination: 3.IV.H and 5.VI.K | Typo |
| 1 | 7 | Strategy #4; Third line of paragraph 1 | “integrate <u>coordinate</u> with Federal programs” | Clarification that California will continue its own programs |
| 1.II, Strategy #5 | 8 | “AB 32 calls for an annual Report Card . . . “ | <p>Factual error – it is not AB 32 that calls for the report card. This requirement is in Government Code sections 12890 – 12893, added by Senate Bill No. 85 (2007). Change text to:</p> <p>SB 85, approved in August 2007, calls for an annual report card...</p> | Factual error |
| 1 | 8 | Opportunity #1 | See Chapters 3.III.C <u>3.IV.E and 3.IV.F</u> | typo |
| 1.II, Opportunity #1 | 1-8 | None. | <p>There are many programs and measures proposed in this report which, if implemented independently of each other, can result in duplicative efforts and waste of ratepayer/ taxpayer dollars. Add the following proposed text as third paragraph under Opportunity #1:</p> <p><i>“Energy efficiency opportunities exist in all the</i></p> | Major – discussion required |

| | | | | |
|----------------------|-----|---|--|---|
| | | | sectors considered in this report. ETAAC recommends that the State, in considering these opportunities, ensure the proposed programs and measures are coordinated to avoid overlaps, duplication, and double-counting.” | |
| 1.II, Opportunity #1 | 1-8 | Second paragraph: “ETAAC believes that new types of financing will increase the development and adoption of energy efficient technologies and practices.” | While financing is likely to increase adoption of existing technologies, we do not yet know if the availability of financing (such as on-bill financing) will lead to development of new technologies. (p.1-6) Thus, we recommend the use of “could” instead of “will”, as follows: “ETAAC believes that new types of financing could increase the development and adoption of energy efficient technologies and practices.” | Major – discussion required |
| 1.II, Opportunity #2 | 1-8 | “ETAAC identified the issues in increasing the State’s Renewable Portfolio Standard to 33 Percent by 2020 – paying particular attention to the barriers that must be overcome (see Chapter 5.III.C).” | The existing text is inconsistent with content in 5.III.C, which describes necessary steps to support 33 percent renewables, but does not call for an increase to 33 percent RPS. Revise text to: “ETAAC also identified barriers that must be overcome (See Chapter 5.III.C) to support an increase in renewable energy or carbon-free equivalent to 33 percent.” | Error correction |
| 1 | 8 | Opportunity #2 | ... could produce renewable energy supplies and permanently remove carbon from the atmosphere provided that there are not net adverse air quality effects from growing and using the biomass (see Chapters 4.II.D , 5.III.I, 6.II.A 6.II.A, 6.II.C, 6.II.D, 7.IV.A | typo |
| 1 | 9 | Opportunity #2 | In the AB32 timeframe, ETAAC believes fossil fuels including specifically natural gas, can play an important role ...” | Clarification that we specifically mean natural gas |
| 1 | 9 | Opportunity#2 | (See Chapters 4.II.C; 5.V.I) | typo |
| 1 | 9 | Opportunity #3 | See Chapter 3.IV 3.III) Local government land | typo |

| | | | | |
|----------------------|------|--|---|---|
| | | | use planning will need to be coordinated with .. commercial development (<u>See Chapter 3.III.A</u>) | |
| 1.II, Opportunity #4 | 1-10 | “Significant opportunities exist to reduce these GHG emissions through established best practices such as the expanded use of combined heat and power in industry (see Chapter 4.II.C).” | As discussed in Chapter 4, expanded use of CHP should only apply to qualifying CHP. Thus, the text should be corrected to include the following qualifier: “Significant opportunities exist to reduce these GHG emissions through established best practices such as the expanded and judicious use of combined heat and power in industry (see Chapter 4.II.C).” | Error correction |
| 1 | 10 | Opportunity #4 | (See Chapter 6.II.E, 6.II F , and 7.II.B 7.IV.B) There is also an opportunity to capitalize on soil sequestering benefits of soil and biomass and reduce end use water demand by providing... | 1) Typo; 2) repetitive statement to last sentence of first paragraph |
| 1 | 10 | Opportunity #5, last sentence | (This trend is under e way) | typo |
| 1 | 11 | First line of last paragraph | The challenges of AB 32, ; | typo |
| 1 | 12 | 3 rd paragraph | Meeting the <u>To meet</u> the timeframe outlined in AB32 | Gramtical error |
| 1 | 12 | 2 nd bullet | Establish a clear market price on carbon to provide the incentives for businesses es and consumers to reduce their carbon emissions efficiently; <u>and California should</u> invest the value of any resulting auction or fee revenues to achieve additional reductions; | I think I used poor drafting earlier, improperly implying perhaps that carbon value should flow to biz/consumers for them to invest in reductions |
| 1 | 15 | Second Paragraph | “ETAAC met nine times throughout” | clarification |
| 1 | 15 | 2 nd paragraph | (a summary table of suggestions received prior to the drafting of this report -in presented in | Should not imply that all |

| | | | | |
|--|------|---|--|-----------------------------|
| | | | Appendix VI | comments are in Appendix VI |
| 1 | 16 | 1 st paragraph last line | Appendix <u>I</u> V and VI I | typo |
| 1 | 17 | Header for matrix | VI I Mapping <i>Note – this is very valuable, and a table with lines will improve readability</i> | typo |
| 1.VII, Mapping of Recommendations to Categories, Timeframe and Responsible Parties | 1-19 | 5. Electricity and Natural Gas “C. Support an Increase in RPS to 33 Percent by 2020” | The existing text is incorrect. Revise to match heading in 5.III.C as follows: “C. Take Steps Necessary to Support an Increase in Renewable Energy to 33 Percent by 2020 to Reduce GHG Emissions” | Error correction |